EXHIBIT "V"

Wallie Howard, Jr. Center for Forensic Sciences 100 ELIZABETH BLACKWELL ST.

SYRACUSE, NY 13210

PHONE 315-435-3800 FAX 315-435-5048

& COUN

REPORT OF LABORATORY ANALYSIS Report #1

JOANNE M. MAHONEY County Executive

INDU GUPTA, MD, MPH

Commissioner of Health

Director of Laboratories

KATHLEEN CORRADO, PhD

FORENSIC BIOLOGY/DNA SECTION

LABORATORY #: L15-0654 **AGENCY CASE** #: 87-037611 INVESTIGATING AGENCY: Syracuse Police Department

511 South State Street Syracuse, NY 13202

ITEMS FOR EXAMINATION:

ITEM#	RECEIVED	ITEM DESCRIPTION
2	06/10/2015	Pubic Hair Exemplar from Valerie Hill
3	06/10/2015	Personal Papers
4	06/10/2015	Drinking Glass (Broken)
7	06/10/2015	Rum Bottle
9	06/10/2015	Drinking Glass
11	06/10/2015	Drinking Glass
12	06/10/2015	Underwear
13	06/10/2015	Wine Bottle
15	06/10/2015	Personal Papers
16	06/10/2015	Personal Papers
17	06/10/2015	Personal Papers
18	06/10/2015	Personal Papers
19	06/10/2015	Personal Papers
20	06/10/2015	Sexual Offense Evidence Collection Kit from Valerie Hill Containing Cervical,
		Rectal and Oral Swabs, Red Liquid, Perianal Fecal Matter, Head Hair Standard,
		Pubic Hair Standard, Pubic Hair Tape Lift, Tape Lt. Front Leg, Tapings Front
		Rt Leg, Tampon, Paper Bag Labeled "Trace Evidence" (appears empty),
		Microscope Slide Holder Labeled "Slide Oral, Rectal, Cervical, Vaginal" and 11
		Hairs Mounted on Microscope Slides
21	06/10/2015	Miscellaneous Items Including Pipe and Film Canister
22	06/10/2015	Red Blanket
23	06/10/2015	Blue Robe
24	06/10/2015	Lab Slides
25	06/10/2015	Blue Robe Belt
26	07/20/2015	Cigarette Butts (7)
27	07/24/2015	Known Oral Standard from Icie Hill

RESULTS:

Using the presumptive phenolphthalein test, blood was not detected on the wine bottle (Item 13). The pubic hair exemplar from Valerie Hill (Item 2), personal papers (Item 3, 15, 16, 17, 18 and 19), underwear (Item 12), sexual offense evidence collection kit from Valerie Hill containing cervical, rectal and oral swabs, red liquid, perianal fecal matter, head hair standard, pubic hair standard, pubic hair tape lift, tape lt. front leg, tapings front RT leg, tampon, paper bag labeled "trace evidence" (appears empty), microscope slide holder labeled "slide oral, rectal, cervical, vaginal" and 11 hairs mounted on microscope slides (Item 20), miscellaneous items including pipe and film canister (Item 21), red blanket (Item 22), blue robe (Item 23), lab slides (Item 24), blue robe belt (Item 25) and known oral standard from Icie Hill (Item 27) were not analyzed.

AGENCY CASE #: 87-037611

DNA was extracted from the rims of the drinking glasses (items 4, 9 and 11), rum bottle (item 7) and wine bottle (item 13) and the cigarette butts (item 26) using a QIAamp kit and quantified using a Plexor HY Human and Male DNA Quantification Kit. The DNA from 5 of the cigarette butts (from item 26) was amplified by the Polymerase Chain Reaction (PCR) utilizing the AmpFlSTR Identifiler Plus kit for the following loci: D8S1179, D21S11, D7S820, CSF1PO, D3S1358, TH01, D13S317, D16S539, D2S1338, D19S433, vWA, TPOX, D18S51, D5S818, FGA and the gender marker Amelogenin (AMEL). Separation and visualization of the Short Tandem Repeat (STR) fragments was achieved using an ABI 3130 Genetic Analyzer unit.

The DNA profiles obtained from the three of the cigarette butts (from item 26) were contributed by the same male donor (Unknown Male 1).

The DNA profile obtained from the one of the cigarette butts (from item 26) was contributed by a single female donor.

The DNA profile obtained from the one of the cigarette butts (from item 26) was contributed by a single male donor (Unknown Male 2).

Due to an insufficient amount of human DNA for PCR analysis, the drinking glasses (items 4, 9 and 11), rum bottle (item 7) and two of the cigarette butts (from item 26) were not profiled.

No DNA was detected on the wine bottle (item 13); therefore the wine bottle was not profiled.

The DNA profiles obtained from 2 of the cigarette butts (from item 26) will be entered into the local, state, and/or national CODIS databases. Your agency will be informed if a significant match is obtained.

If further analysis is desired, please contact the Forensic Biology/DNA section at 435-3800. Please allow a minimum of 12 weeks from the submission of additional evidence for DNA analysis.

AGENCY CASE #: 87-037611

DISPOSITION OF EVIDENCE: The swabbings from the drinking glasses (items 4, 9 and 11), rum bottle (item 7) and wine bottle (item 13), cigarette butts (item 26), cervical, rectal and oral swabs (from item 20) and remaining DNA extracts will be retained at the laboratory. The remaining evidence will be returned to the submitting agency.

Please see www.criminaljustice.ny.gov/forensic/labreportstandards.htm for definitions of significant terms used in this report.

This report contains the conclusions, opinions and interpretations of the certifying examiner whose signature appears on the report. This report does not constitute the entire case record. The case record may be comprised of worksheets, images, analytical data, and other documents. I certify that this report accurately reflects the results of an examination, comparison, or test performed by me. False statements made herein are punishable as a class A misdemeanor pursuant to Section 210.45 of the Penal Law of the State of New York.

AFFIRMED UNDER PENALTY OF PERJURY

Results Certified By:

Daniel Cowen, MFS

Forensic Scientist-Forensic Biology/DNA

Page 3 of 3

08/28/2015

Date:

REPORT OF LABORATORY ANALYSIS

Wallie Howard, Jr. Center for Forensic Sciences

COUNT

Report #2 100 ELIZABETH BLACKWELL ST. FORENSIC BIOLOGY/DNA SECTION SYRACUSE, NY 13210 PHONE 315-435-3800 FAX 315-435-5048

JOANNE M. MAHONEY County Executive

INDU GUPTA, MD, MPH Commissioner of Health

KATHLEEN CORRADO, PhD Director of Laboratories

LABORATORY #: L15-0654 **AGENCY CASE #:** 87-037611 **INVESTIGATING AGENCY:**

Syracuse Police Department 511 South State Street Syracuse, NY 13202

ITEMS FOR EXAMINATION:

ITEM#	RECEIVED	ITEM DESCRIPTION
20.2	06/10/2015	Cervical Swab
20.3	06/10/2015	Rectal Swab
20.4	06/10/2015	Oral Swab
20.5	06/10/2015	Tampon
25	06/10/2015	Robe Belt
27	07/24/2015	Known Oral Standard from Icie Hill
28	10/13/2015	Roach Clip
29	10/20/2015	Bottle
30	10/27/2015	Cigarette Butt
31	10/27/2015	Known Oral Standard from David Hill
32	11/18/2015	Known Oral Standard from Hector Rivas

RESULTS:

A presumptive phenolphthalein test for the presence of blood was positive on a stain from the robe belt (Item 25). No spermatozoa were identified by microscopic analysis on the cervical swab (Item 20.2), rectal swab (Item 20.3), oral swab (Item 20.4) or tampon (Item 20.5). Trace evidence was collected from the robe belt (Item 25). The collected trace evidence was retained with the original item.

DNA was extracted from a stain from the robe belt (Item 25) and from the cervical swab (Item 20.2), rectal swab (Item 20.3), oral swab (Item 20.4), tampon (Item 20.5), ends of the robe belt (Item 25), known oral standard from Icie Hill (Item 27), roach clip (Item 28), opening of the bottle (Item 29), cigarette butt (Item 30), known oral standard from David Hill (Item 31) and known oral standard from Hector Rivas (Item 32) using the DNA IQ Casework Pro Kit with the Maxwell 16 and quantified using a Plexor HY Human and Male DNA Quantification Kit. The DNA from oral swab from Valerie Hill (Item 20.4), stain from the robe belt (Item 25), known oral standard from Icie Hill (Item 27), known oral standard from David Hill (Item 31) and known oral standard from Hector Rivas (Item 32) was amplified by the Polymerase Chain Reaction (PCR) utilizing the AmpFISTR Identifiler Plus kit for the following loci: D8S1179, D21S11, D7S820, CSF1PO, D3S1358, TH01, D13S317, D16S539, D2S1338, D19S433, vWA, TPOX, D18S51, D5S818, FGA and the gender marker Amelogenin (AMEL). Separation and visualization of the Short Tandem Repeat (STR) fragments was achieved using an ABI 3130 Genetic Analyzer unit.

AGENCY CASE #: 87-037611

The DNA profile obtained from the cigarette butt (from Item 26, see report #1) was contributed by a single male donor. The DNA profile obtained from the cigarette butt (from Item 26, see report #1) matches, at 13 STR loci, the DNA profile of Hector Rivas (Item 32). The profile at the remaining loci is consistent with Hector Rivas (Item 32) being a contributor of the DNA obtained from the cigarette butt (from Item 26, see report #1), but is not suitable for use in the statistical interpretation. The probability of an unrelated individual having an STR profile matching the obtained DNA profile at the D8S1179, D21S11, D3S1358, TH01, D13S317, D16S539, D2S1338, D19S433, vWA, TPOX, D18S51, D5S818 and FGA loci is less than 1 in 127 trillion. It can be concluded that Hector Rivas (Item 32) is the source of the DNA from the cigarette butt (from Item 26, see report #1) (excluding identical siblings).

The DNA profile obtained from the cigarette butt (from Item 26, see report #1) was contributed by a single male donor. The DNA profile obtained from the cigarette butt (from Item 26, see report #1) matches, at 10 STR loci, the DNA profile of Hector Rivas (Item 32). The profile at the remaining loci is consistent with Hector Rivas (Item 32) being a contributor of the DNA obtained from the cigarette butt (from Item 26, see report #1), but is not suitable for use in the statistical interpretation. The probability of an unrelated individual having an STR profile matching the obtained DNA profile at the D8S1179, D21S11, D3S1358, TH01, D13S317, D16S539, D19S433, vWA, D5S818 and FGA loci is less than 1 in 70.4 billion.

The DNA profile obtained from the cigarette butt (from Item 26, see report #1) was contributed by a single male donor. The DNA profile obtained from the cigarette butt (from Item 26, see report #1) matches, at 5 STR loci, the DNA profile of Hector Rivas (Item 32). The profile at D21S11, D7S820, TH01, D13S317, vWA and TPOX loci is consistent with Hector Rivas (Item 32) being a contributor of the DNA obtained from the cigarette butt (from Item 26, see report #1), but is not suitable for use in the statistical interpretation. No interpretable DNA profile was obtained at the CSF1PO, D16S539, D2S1338 or D18S51 loci. The probability of an unrelated individual having an STR profile matching the obtained DNA profile at the D8S1179, D3S1358, D19S433, D5S818 and FGA loci is less than 1 in 320 thousand.

The DNA profiles obtained from the cigarette butts (from Item 26, see report #1) do not match the DNA profiles obtained from Valerie Hill (Item 20.4), David Hill (Item 31) or Icie Hill (Item 27). Therefore, Valerie Hill (Item 20.4), David Hill (Item 31) and Icie Hill (Item 27) are excluded as possible donors of the DNA profiles obtained from the cigarette butts (from Item 26, see report #1).

The DNA profile obtained from the cigarette butt (from Item 26, see report #1) was contributed by a single female donor. The DNA profile obtained from the cigarette butt (from Item 26, see report #1) matches, at 4 STR loci, the DNA profile of Valerie Hill (Item 20.4). The profile at D8S1179, TH01, D16S539, TPOX, D18S51 and D5S818 loci is consistent with Valerie Hill (Item 20.4) being a contributor of the DNA obtained from the cigarette butt (from Item 26, see report #1), but is not suitable for use in the statistical interpretation. No interpretable DNA profile was obtained at the D21S11, D7S820, CSF1PO, D13S317 or D2S1338 loci. The probability of an unrelated individual having an STR profile matching the obtained DNA profile at the D3S1358, D19S433, vWA and FGA loci is less than 1 in 12.4 thousand.

AGENCY CASE #: 87-037611

The DNA profile obtained from the robe belt stain (Item 25) was contributed by a single female donor. The DNA profile obtained from the robe belt stain (Item 25) matches, at 13 STR loci, the DNA profile of Valerie Hill (Item 20.4). The profile at the remaining loci is consistent with Valerie Hill (Item 20.4) being a contributor of the DNA obtained from the robe belt stain (Item 25), but is not suitable for use in the statistical interpretation. The probability of an unrelated individual having an STR profile matching the obtained DNA profile at the D8S1179, D21S11, D7S820, CSF1PO, D3S1358, TH01, D13S317, D16S539, D19S433, vWA, TPOX, D5S818 and FGA loci is less than 1 in 8.31 trillion. It can be concluded that Valerie Hill (Item 20.4) is the source of the DNA from the robe belt stain (Item 25) (excluding identical siblings).

The DNA profiles obtained from the cigarette butt (from Item 26, see report #1) and robe belt stain (Item 25) do not match the DNA profiles obtained from Icie Hill (Item 27), David Hill (Item 31) or Hector Rivas (Item 32). Therefore, Icie Hill (Item 27), David Hill (Item 31) and Hector Rivas (Item 32) are excluded as possible donors of the DNA profiles obtained from cigarette butt (from Item 26, see report #1) and robe belt stain (Item 25).

Due to an insufficient amount of human DNA for PCR analysis, the cigarette butt (Item 30) was not profiled.

Due to the low quantity of male DNA, the sperm fraction of the rectal swab (Item 20.3) was not profiled with the AmpFlSTR Identifiler Plus kit.

No male DNA was detected on the non-sperm fraction of the cervical swab (Item 20.2), the sperm fraction of the oral swab (Item 20.4) or the non-sperm fraction or sperm fraction of the tampon (Item 20.5), therefore the non-sperm fraction of the cervical swab (Item 20.2), the sperm fraction of the oral swab (Item 20.4) and the non-sperm fraction and sperm fraction of the tampon (Item 20.5) were not profiled.

No DNA was detected on the sperm fraction of the cervical swab (Item 20.2), non-sperm fraction of the rectal swab (Item 20.3), roach clip (Item 28) or bottle (Item 29); therefore the sperm fraction of the cervical swab (Item 20.2), non-sperm fraction of the rectal swab (Item 20.3), roach clip (Item 28) and opening of the bottle (Item 29) were not profiled.

Analysis of the swabbings from the robe belt ends (Item 25) will be the subject of a future report.

Based on the observation that the donor of the DNA profile obtained from the cigarette butt (from Item 26, see report #1) shares an allele, at 13 STR loci, with David Hill (Item 31), the donor of the DNA profile obtained from the cigarette butt (from Item 26, see report #1) cannot be excluded as the biological father of David Hill (Item 31). No interpretable DNA profile was obtained from the cigarette butt (from Item 26, see report #1) at the CSF1PO or D2S1338 loci, therefore these loci will not be used for statistical interpretation. It is 384 thousand times more likely that the genotype of David Hill (Item 31) would be observed if the donor of the DNA profile obtained from the cigarette butt (from Item 26, see report #1) is the biological father, than if a random, unrelated male in the Caucasian population is the biological father of David Hill (Item 31).

AGENCY CASE #: 87-037611

The DNA profile obtained from the robe belt stain (Item 25) is not eligible for entry into the CODIS database.

If further analysis is desired, please contact the Forensic Biology/DNA section at 435-3800. Please allow a minimum of 12 weeks from the submission of additional evidence for DNA analysis.

DISPOSITION OF EVIDENCE: The cervical swab (Item 20.2), rectal swab (Item 20.3), oral swab (Item 20.4), tampon (Item 20.5), swabbings from the robe belt (Item 25), known oral standard from Icie Hill (Item 27), swabbings from the roach clip (Item 28), swabbings from the opening of the bottle (Item 29), cigarette butt (Item 30), known oral standard from David Hill (Item 31) and known oral standard from Hector Rivas (Item 32) and remaining DNA extracts will be retained at the laboratory. The remaining evidence will be returned to the submitting agency.

Please see www.criminaljustice.ny.gov/forensic/labreportstandards.htm for definitions of significant terms used in this report.

This report contains the conclusions, opinions and interpretations of the certifying examiner whose signature appears on the report. This report does not constitute the entire case record. The case record may be comprised of worksheets, images, analytical data, and other documents. I certify that this report accurately reflects the results of an examination, comparison, or test performed by me. False statements made herein are punishable as a class A misdemeanor pursuant to Section 210.45 of the Penal Law of the State of New York.

AFFIRMED UNDER PENALTY OF PERJURY

Results Certified By:

Daniel Cowen, MFS

Forensic Scientist-Forensic Biology/DNA

Page 4 of 4

01/19/2016

Date:

Wallie Howard, Jr. Center for Forensic Sciences

GA COUN

100 ELIZABETH BLACKWELL ST. SYRACUSE, NY 13210 PHONE 315-435-3800 FAX 315-435-5048

REPORT OF LABORATORY ANALYSIS Report #3

LATENT PRINT SECTION

JOANNE M. MAHONEY County Executive

INDU GUPTA, MD, MPH Commissioner of Health

KATHLEEN CORRADO, PhD Director of Laboratories

LABORATORY #: L15-0654

AGENCY CASE #: 87-037611

INVESTIGATING AGENCY: Syracuse Police Department 511 South State Street

Syracuse, NY 13202

ITEMS FOR EXAMINATION:

ITEM#	RECEIVED	ITEM DESCRIPTION
3	06/10/2015	One key ring containing seven keys and one paper keychain labeled "5", five Post-it
		notes with handwriting, one torn piece of white paper with handwriting, one torn piece
		of blank white paper, one purple envelope addressed to "Ms. Valerie Hill", and ten
		pages of handwritten letters
4	06/10/2015	One broken drinking glass and two paper towels
5	06/10/2015	Two BENNIGAN'S matchbooks containing matches
6	06/10/2015	One BENNIGAN'S matchbook containing matches
7	06/10/2015	One BACARDI Superior Rum glass bottle received with one piece of lift tape adhered
		to side
7.2	06/10/2015	One latent print lift card containing the lift tape removed from the BACARDI Superior
		Rum glass bottle
8	06/10/2015	One blue CRICKET lighter
9	06/10/2015	One clear drinking glass
10	06/10/2015	One Stephen King "The Dark Tower: The Gunslinger" book, one clear plastic book
		jacket, two brown paper book covers, one pink Mid-York library card, one piece of
		paper with handwriting, and one brown envelope addressed to the Cazenovia Library
11	06/10/2015	One clear drinking glass
13	06/10/2015	One empty BLUE NUN White Wine glass bottle received with four pieces of lift tape
		adhered to side
13.2	06/10/2015	One latent print lift card containing one piece of lift tape removed from the BLUE NUN
		White Wine glass bottle
13.3	06/10/2015	One latent print lift card containing one piece of lift tape removed from the BLUE NUN
		White Wine glass bottle
13.4	06/10/2015	One latent print lift card containing one piece of lift tape removed from the BLUE NUN
		White Wine glass bottle
13.5	06/10/2015	One latent print lift card containing one piece of lift tape removed from the BLUE NUN
		White Wine glass bottle
15	06/10/2015	Two sheets of blank white paper
16	06/10/2015	Two yellow pieces of paper with handwriting
17	06/10/2015	One yellow Post-it note with handwriting
18	06/10/2015	One white sheet of paper with handwriting
19	06/10/2015	One lined sheet of paper with handwriting
21	06/10/2015	One plastic "AQUA PIPE", one black film canister with a blue plastic cover, one black
		film canister, one metal pipe, and one pleated sandwich bag
29	10/20/2015	One empty 16oz glass PEPSI-COLA bottle
33	12/14/2015	One inked fingerprint card and two inked palmprint cards bearing the name Hector M.
		Rivas (DOB 2/20/1952, date printed 11/25/1992)

AGENCY CASE #: 87-037611

Two live-scan fingerprint cards bearing the name Hector Rivas (NYSID #01375082H, DOB 02/20/1952, dates fingerprinted 03/24/2015 and 04/17/2015) obtained at the CFS Laboratories via the OCSO RICI System

One live-scan fingerprint card and two live-scan palmprint cards bearing the name John N. Cassano, Jr. (DOB 04/08/1963) obtained at the CFS Laboratories via the OCSO RICI System

RESULTS:

Items 3 (excluding purple envelope), 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10 (including clear plastic jacket, paper book covers, and glossy book cover/pages only), 11, 13, 15, 16, 17, 18, 19, 21, and 29 were examined for the presence of latent prints utilizing visual, physical, and chemical methods. Item 10 (including non-glossy pages, library card, piece of paper with handwriting, and brown envelope only) was visually examined for the presence of latent prints.

One hundred-thirteen latent prints were digitally captured from Items 3, 4, 5, 7, 9, 10, 11, 13, 16, 17, 18, 19, and 21 and labeled as followed:

- Item 4 (broken drinking glass) Latent prints 4L1 through 4L8, 4L42 through 4L44, 4L49
- Item 7 (BACARDI bottle) Latent prints 7L9 through 7L13, 7L38, and 7L51
- Item 9 (drinking glass) Latent prints 9L14 through 9L21, 9L45 through 9L48, 9L50, and 9L55
- Item 11 (drinking glass) Latent prints 11L22 through 11L30
- Item 13 (BLUE NUN bottle) Latent prints 13L31 through 13L37, 13L39 through 13L41
- Item 21 (film canister and blue film canister cover) Latent prints 21L52 through 21L54
- Item 5 (BENNIGAN'S matchbook) Latent print 5L56
- Item 17 (Post-it note with handwriting) Latent print 17L57
- Item 18 (paper with handwriting) Latent print 18L58
- Item 19 (lined paper with handwriting) Latent print 19L59
- Item 10 (Stephen King book pages) Latent prints 10L60 through 10L67
- Item 10 (clear plastic book jacket) Latent prints 10L68 through 10L83
- Item 16 (two yellow pieces of paper with handwriting) Latent prints 16L84 through 16L88
- Item 3 (miscellaneous personal papers) Latent prints 3L89 through 3L113

No latent prints suitable for identification were observed or developed from the keys in Item 3, the glossy pages in Item 10, or from Items 6, 8, 15 or 29. No latent prints were observed or developed from the paper towels in Item 4, the "AQUA PIPE", metal pipe, or sandwich bag in Item 21, or the paper book cover, library card, brown envelope, or piece of paper with handwriting in Item 10.

Examinations of the latent prints were conducted using the Analysis, Comparison, Evaluation, and Verification (ACE-V) process with the results indicated in the following tables on pages 3 through 6.

L15-0654 Report #3 87-037611 LABORATORY #:

AGENCY CASE #:

Latent Print #	Analysis: Suitable for Identification (Yes/No)	Comparison and Evaluation Results: Key: IDENT - compared, subject identified as source of the latent print *- see SABIS statement in report EXC - compared, subject excluded as source of the latent print INC - inconclusive comparison, subject neither identified nor excluded as source of the latent print (area of additional known prints required for conclusive comparison indicated) NC - subject not compared		
		The latent print(s) were compared to the following known prints bearing the name(s):		
		Hector Rivas	John N. Cassano, Jr.	
4L1 (broken drink glass)	Yes	EXC	NC	
4L2 (broken drink glass)	No			
4L3 (broken drink glass)	Yes	EXC	NC	
4L4 (broken drink glass)	Yes	EXC	NC	
4L5 (broken drink glass)	Yes	INC (need fully recorded tips and joints of fingers)	NC	
4L6 (broken drink glass)	Yes	EXC	NC	
4L7 (broken drink glass)	No			
4L8 (broken drink glass)	No			
7L9 (Bacardi bottle)	No			
7L10 (Bacardi bottle)	Yes	INC (need major case prints)	INC (need major case prints)	
7L11 (Bacardi bottle)	Yes	EXC	EXC	
7L12 (Bacardi bottle)	Yes	EXC	EXC	
7L13 (Bacardi bottle)	Yes	EXC	EXC	
9L14 (drink glass)	Yes	EXC	NC	
9L15 (drink glass)	Yes	EXC	NC	
9L16 (drink glass)	Yes	EXC	NC	
9L17 (drink glass)	No			
9L18 (drink glass)	Yes	EXC	NC	
9L19 (drink glass)	No			
9L20 (drink glass)	Yes	EXC	NC	
9L21 (drink glass)	Yes	EXC	NC	
11L22 (drink glass)	No			
11L23 (drink glass)	No			

LABORATORY #: L15-0654 Report #3 **AGENCY CASE #:** 87-037611

Latent Print #	Analysis: Suitable for Identification (Yes/No)	Comparison and Evaluation Results: Key: IDENT - compared, subject identified as source of the latent print *- see SABIS statement in report EXC - compared, subject excluded as source of the latent print INC - inconclusive comparison, subject neither identified nor excluded as source of the latent print (area of additional known prints required for conclusive comparison indicated) NC - subject not compared The latent print(s) were compared to the following known prints bearing the name(s):		
		Hector Rivas John N. Cassano, Jr.		
11L24 (drink	N	Tiction Rivas	John IV. Cassano, 31.	
glass)	No			
11L25 (drink glass)	No			
11L26 (drink glass)	Yes	EXC	NC	
11L27 (drink glass)	Yes	INC (need fully recorded right index finger)	NC	
11L28 (drink glass)	Yes	EXC	NC	
11L29 (drink glass)	Yes	EXC	NC	
11L30 (drink glass)	Yes	EXC	NC	
13L31 (Blue Nun bottle)	Yes	IDENT	NC	
13L32 (Blue Nun bottle)	Yes	IDENT	NC	
13L33 (Blue Nun bottle)	Yes	IDENT	NC	
13L34 (Blue Nun bottle)	Yes	INC (need fully recorded tips of fingers)	INC (need fully recorded tips of fingers)	
13L35 (Blue Nun bottle)	Yes	IDENT	NC	
13L36 (Blue Nun bottle)	Yes	IDENT	NC	
13L37 (Blue Nun bottle)	No			
7L38 (Bacardi bottle)	Yes	EXC	EXC	
13L39 (Blue Nun bottle)	Yes	IDENT	NC	
13L40 (Blue Nun bottle)	Yes	IDENT	NC	
13L41 (Blue Nun bottle)	No			
4L42 (broken drink glass)	No			
4L43 (broken drink glass)	Yes	EXC	NC	
4L44 (broken drink glass)	No			
9L45 (drink glass)	Yes	EXC	NC	
9L46 (drink glass)	No			

L15-0654 Report #3 87-037611 LABORATORY #:

AGENCY CASE #:

Latent Print #	Analysis: Suitable for Identification (Yes/No)	n (area of additional known prints required for conclusive comparison indicated) NC - subject not compared			
		The latent print(s) were compared to the following			
		Hector Rivas	John N. Cassano, Jr.		
9L47 (drink glass)	Yes	EXC	NC		
9L48 (drink glass)	Yes	EXC	NC		
4L49 (broken drink glass)	Yes	EXC	NC		
9L50 (drink glass)	Yes	EXC	NC		
7L51 (Bacardi bottle)	Yes	INC (need major case prints)	INC (need major case prints)		
21L52 (blue film canister cover)	Yes	IDENT	NC		
21L53 (blue film canister cover)	Yes	IDENT	NC		
21L54 (film canister without cover)	No				
9L55 (drink glass)	No				
5L56 (matchbook)	Yes	EXC	NC		
17L57 (Post-it note)	Yes	EXC	NC		
18L58 (paper with writing)	No				
19L59 (lined paper with writing)	Yes	IDENT	NC		
10L60 (page from book)	Yes	EXC	NC		
10L61 (page from book)	Yes	EXC	NC		
10L62 (page from book)	No				
10L63 (page from book)	Yes	EXC	NC		
10L64 (page from book)	No				
10L65 (page from book)	No				
10L66 (page from book)	Yes	INC (need fully recorded sides of fingers)	NC		
10L67 (page from book)	No				

AGENCY CASE #: 87-037611

Latent Print #	Analysis: Suitable for Identification (Yes/No)	Key: IDENT - compared, subject identified as source EXC - compared, subject excluded as source of INC - inconclusive comparison, subject neither (area of additional known prints required NC - subject not compared	the latent print identified nor excluded as source of the latent print	
		Hector Rivas	John N. Cassano, Jr.	
10L68 (plastic book jacket)	Yes	EXC	NC	
10L69 (plastic book jacket)	Yes	EXC	NC	
10L70 (plastic book jacket)	Yes	EXC	NC	
10L71 (plastic book jacket)	Yes	EXC	NC	
10L73 (plastic book jacket)	Yes	NC	NC	
10L74 (plastic book jacket)	Yes	IDENT	NC	
10L76 (plastic book jacket)	Yes	NC	NC	
10L77 (plastic book jacket)	Yes	IDENT	NC	
16L84 (paper with writing)	Yes	NC	NC	
16L86 (paper with writing)	Yes	EXC	NC	
16L87 (paper with writing)	Yes	NC	NC	
16L88 (paper with writing)	Yes	NC	NC	

Analysis of latent prints 10L72, 10L75, 10L78 through 10L83, 16L85, and 3L89 through 3L113 for suitability for identification, as well as comparison of latent prints 10L73, 10L76, 16L84, 16L87, and 16L88 has been deferred at this time per Assistant District Attorney Robert Moran. Examination of the purple envelope from Item 3 has also been deferred at this time per Assistant District Attorney Robert Moran. If further examination would significantly aid in the investigation, please contact the author of this report.

A Statewide Automated Biometric Identification System (SABIS) analysis of the remaining unidentified latent prints from the above listed items determined that there are latent prints suitable for SABIS entry. A SABIS search has been deferred pending the availability of elimination fingerprints and palmprints of Valerie Hill.

If elimination prints of Valerie Hill, or additional known prints of Hector Rivas or John N. Cassano Jr. become available for comparison, please contact the author of this report.

AGENCY CASE #: 87-037611

REMARKS:

The digitally captured latent prints from Items 3, 4, 5, 7, 9, 10, 11, 13, 16, 17, 18, 19, and 21 have been preserved and retained at the CFS Laboratories.

Digital scans of the handwriting from Items 3, 16, 17, 18, and 19 have been preserved and retained at the CFS Laboratories.

Apparent hairs/fibers were observed in the adhesive of the Post-it note in Item 17 and were retained in the original packaging.

Please see www.criminaljustice.ny.gov/forensic/labreportstandards.htm for definitions of significant terms used in this report.

This report contains the conclusions, opinions and interpretations of the certifying examiner whose signature appears on the report. This report does not constitute the entire case record. The case record may be comprised of worksheets, images, analytical data, and other documents. I certify that this report accurately reflects the results of an examination, comparison, or test performed by me. False statements made herein are punishable as a class A misdemeanor pursuant to Section 210.45 of the Penal Law of the State of New York.

AFFIRMED UNDER PENALTY OF PERJURY

Results Certified By:

Ashley Mull

Latent Print Examiner

by Mull

Date:

04/05/2016

Wallie Howard, Jr. Center for Forensic Sciences 100 ELIZABETH BLACKWELL ST.

SYRACUSE, NY 13210

PHONE 315-435-3800 FAX 315-435-5048

& COUN

REPORT OF LABORATORY ANALYSIS
Report #4

JOANNE M. MAHONEY County Executive

FORENSIC BIOLOGY/DNA SECTION

INDU GUPTA, MD, MPH Commissioner of Health

KATHLEEN CORRADO, PhD Director of Laboratories

LABORATORY #: L15-0654 **AGENCY CASE #:** 87-037611

INVESTIGATING AGENCY:

Syracuse Police Department 511 South State Street

Syracuse, NY 13202

ITEMS FOR EXAMINATION:

ITEM#	RECEIVED	ITEM DESCRIPTION
3	06/10/2015	Miscellaneous papers including envelope with red/brown stains and keys
8	06/10/2015	Lighter
14	06/10/2015	Tape lifts from left and right legs of Valerie Hill
20.4	12/11/2015	Oral swab from Valerie Hill (previously extracted)
21	06/10/2015	Pipes (2) and film canisters (2)
22	06/10/2015	Blanket
23	06/10/2015	Robe
24	06/10/2015	5 microscope slides reading "pubic H. Rivas" with apparent hairs
25.1	12/08/2015	Swabbing from end of belt (previously extracted)
34	03/30/2016	6 empty pill boxes, 6 microscope slides with apparent hairs
35	03/30/2016	Telephone
37	03/30/2016	Bottle
38	03/30/2016	Bottle
39	03/30/2016	Bottle
41	03/30/2016	Empty pill box
43	03/30/2016	Bottle
45	03/31/2016	Shirt

RESULTS:

Presumptive phenolphthalein tests for the presence of blood were positive in stains from the robe (Item 23) and shirt (Item 45). Using the presumptive phenolphthalein test, blood was not detected on the envelope (from Item 3). Trace evidence was collected from the robe (Item 23) and shirt (Item 45). The collected trace evidence was retained with the original items. Potential trace evidence was preserved with the blanket (Item 22). The miscellaneous papers and keys (from Item 3), tape lifts from left and right legs of Valerie Hill (Item 14), film canisters (from Item 21), blanket (Item 22), 5 microscope slides reading "pubic H. Rivas" with apparent hairs (Item 24), 6 empty pill boxes, 6 microscope slides with apparent hairs (Item 34), telephone (Item 35), bottle (Item 37), bottle (Item 38), bottle (Item 39), empty pill box (Item 41) and bottle (Item 43) were not analyzed.

DNA was extracted from the lighter (Item 8) and pipes (from Item 21) and stains from the robe (Item 23) and shirt (Item 45) using a QIAamp kit and quantified using a Plexor HY Human and Male DNA Quantification Kit. The DNA from one of the pipes (from Item 21), the oral swab from Valerie Hill (Item 20.4.1), belt ends (item 25.1) and stains from the robe (Item 23) and shirt (Item 45) was amplified by the Polymerase Chain Reaction (PCR) utilizing the AmpFlSTR Identifiler Plus kit for the following loci: D8S1179, D21S11, D7S820, CSF1PO, D3S1358, TH01, D13S317, D16S539, D2S1338, D19S433, vWA, TPOX, D18S51, D5S818, FGA and the gender marker Amelogenin (AMEL). Separation and visualization of the Short Tandem Repeat (STR) fragments was achieved using an ABI 3130 Genetic Analyzer unit.

AGENCY CASE #: 87-037611

The DNA profiles obtained from the stains from the robe (Item 23) and shirt (Item 45) were contributed by the same female donor.

The DNA profile obtained from the belt ends (Item 25.1) is indicative of a mixture of at least 2 contributors.

The major component of the DNA profile obtained from the belt ends (Items 25.1) and the DNA profiles obtained from the stains from the robe (Item 23) and shirt (Item 45) were contributed by the same female donor. The major component of the DNA profile obtained from the belt ends (Items 25.1) and the DNA profiles obtained from the stains from the robe (Item 23) and shirt (Item 45) match, at 15 STR loci, the DNA profile obtained from Valerie Hill (item 20.4). The probability of an unrelated individual having an STR profile matching the obtained DNA profile is less than 1 in 3.96 quadrillion. It can be concluded that Valerie Hill is the source of the major component of the DNA profile obtained from the belt ends (Items 25.1) and the DNA profiles obtained from the stains from the robe (Item 23) and shirt (Item 45) (excluding identical siblings).

The major component of the DNA profile obtained from the belt ends (Items 25.1) and the DNA profiles obtained from the stains from the robe (Item 23) and shirt (Item 45) do not match the DNA profiles obtained from Hector Rivas (Item 32, see report #2), Icie Hill (Item 27, see report #2) or David Hill (Item 31, see report #2). Therefore, Hector Rivas (Item 32, see report #2), Icie Hill (Item 27, see report #2) and David Hill (Item 31, see report #2) are excluded as possible donors of the major component of the DNA profile obtained from the belt ends (Items 25.1) and the DNA profiles obtained from the stains from the robe (Item 23) and shirt (Item 45).

Based on current laboratory interpretation guidelines, the remainder of the DNA profile obtained from the belt ends (Item 25.1) is not suitable for comparison due to the low level activity and number of contributors observed in the profile. It may be possible to further interpret this profile using a different method. If this is of interest and a known standard is available for comparison, please contact the laboratory.

The DNA profile obtained from one of the pipes (from Item 21) is indicative of a mixture of at least 3 contributors. Based on current laboratory interpretation guidelines, the DNA profile obtained from one of the pipes (from Item 21) is not suitable for comparison due to the low level activity and number of contributors observed in the profile. It may be possible to further interpret this profile using a different method. If this is of interest and a known standard is available for comparison, please contact the laboratory.

Due to an insufficient amount of human DNA for PCR analysis, one of the pipes (from Item 21) was not profiled.

No DNA was detected on the lighter (Item 8); therefore the lighter (Item 8) was not profiled.

Based on the observation that donor of the DNA profile obtained from the cigarette butt (from Item 26, see report #1) shares an allele, at 13 STR loci, with Valerie Hill (Item 20.4), the donor of the DNA profile obtained from the cigarette butt (from Item 26, see report #1) cannot be excluded as the biological father of Valerie Hill (Item 20.4). No interpretable DNA profile was obtained from the cigarette butt (from Item 26, see report #1) at the CSF1PO or D2S1338 loci, therefore these loci will not be used for statistical interpretation. It is 119 thousand times more likely that the genotype of Valerie Hill (Item 20.4) would be observed if the donor of the DNA profile obtained from the cigarette butt (from Item 26, see report #1) is the biological father, than if a random, unrelated male in the Caucasian population is the biological father of Valerie Hill (Item 20.4).

AGENCY CASE #: 87-037611

The DNA from the belt ends (Item 25.1) was amplified by the Polymerase Chain Reaction (PCR) utilizing the AmpFlSTR Y-filer kit for the following loci: DYS456, DYS389I, DYS390, DYS389II, DYS458, DYS19, DYS385 a/b, DYS393, DYS391, DYS439, DYS635, DYS392, YGATA H4, DYS437, DYS438, and DYS448. Separation and visualization of the Short Tandem Repeat (STR) fragments was achieved using an ABI 3130 Genetic Analyzer unit.

A mixture of partial Y-STR DNA profiles from at least 3 male contributors was obtained from the belt ends (Item 25.1). Due to the low level activity and the number of contributors observed in the profile, the DNA profile obtained is not suitable for comparison.

The major component of the DNA profile obtained from the belt ends (Item 25.1), the DNA profiles obtained from the stains from the robe (Item 23) and shirt (Item 45) and the DNA profile obtained from one of the pipes (from item 21) are not eligible for entry into the CODIS database.

If further analysis is desired, please contact the Forensic Biology/DNA section at 435-3800. Please allow a minimum of 12 weeks from the submission of additional evidence for DNA analysis.

DISPOSITION OF EVIDENCE: The swabbings from the pipes (from Item 21) and lighter (Item 8) and cuttings from the robe (Item 23) and shirt (Item 45) stains and remaining DNA extracts will be retained at the laboratory. The remaining evidence will be returned to the submitting agency.

Please see www.criminaljustice.ny.gov/forensic/labreportstandards.htm for definitions of significant terms used in this report.

This report contains the conclusions, opinions and interpretations of the certifying examiner whose signature appears on the report. This report does not constitute the entire case record. The case record may be comprised of worksheets, images, analytical data, and other documents. I certify that this report accurately reflects the results of an examination, comparison, or test performed by me. False statements made herein are punishable as a class A misdemeanor pursuant to Section 210.45 of the Penal Law of the State of New York.

AFFIRMED UNDER PENALTY OF PERJURY

Results Certified By:

Daniel Cowen, MFS

Forensic Scientist-Forensic Biology/DNA

Date: 04/19/2016

REPORT OF LABORATORY ANALYSIS

Wallie Howard, Jr. Center for Forensic Sciences 100 ELIZABETH BLACKWELL ST.

SYRACUSE, NY 13210

PHONE 315-435-3800 FAX 315-435-5048

CA COUNT

Report #5

LATENT PRINT SECTION

JOANNE M. MAHONEY County Executive

INDU GUPTA, MD, MPH

INDU GUPTA, MD, MPH Commissioner of Health

KATHLEEN CORRADO PhD

KATHLEEN CORRADO, PhD Director of Laboratories

LABORATORY #: L15-0654

AGENCY CASE #: 87-037611

INVESTIGATING AGENCY:

Syracuse Police Department 511 South State Street Syracuse, NY 13202

ITEMS FOR EXAMINATION:

ITEM#	RECEIVED	ITEM DESCRIPTION
3	06/10/2015	One key ring containing seven keys and one paper keychain labeled "5", five
		Post-it notes with handwriting, one torn piece of white paper with handwriting,
		one torn piece of blank white paper, one purple envelope addressed to "Ms.
		Valerie Hill", and ten pages of handwritten letters
4	06/10/2015	One broken drinking glass and two paper towels
5	06/10/2015	Two BENNIGAN'S matchbooks containing matches
7	06/10/2015	One BACARDI Superior Rum glass bottle received with one piece of lift tape
_		adhered to side
9	06/10/2015	One clear drinking glass
10	06/10/2015	One Stephen King "The Dark Tower: The Gunslinger" book, one clear plastic
		book jacket, two brown paper book covers, one pink Mid-York library card, one
		piece of paper with handwriting, and one brown envelope addressed to the
		Cazenovia Library
11	06/10/2015	One clear drinking glass
13	06/10/2015	One empty BLUE NUN White Wine glass bottle received with four pieces of lift
		tape adhered to side
17	06/10/2015	One yellow Post-it note with handwriting
33	12/14/2015	One inked fingerprint card and two inked palmprint cards bearing the name
		Hector M. Rivas (DOB 02/20/1952, date printed 11/25/1992)
35	03/30/2016	One CONAIRPHONE push button telephone
36	03/30/2016	One NYNEX phone book
37	03/30/2016	Indicated on Evidence Submission Receipt as one bottle of Triple Sec
38	03/30/2016	Indicated on Evidence Submission Receipt as one bottle of table wine
39	03/30/2016	Indicated on Evidence Submission Receipt as one bottle of brandy
40	03/30/2016	One metal ashtray received with one piece of lift tape adhered to bottom
40.1	03/30/2016	One latent print lift card containing the lift tape removed from the metal ashtray
42	03/30/2016	Miscellaneous contents including two library cards purported as being from the
		victim's trashcan
43	03/30/2016	Indicated on Evidence Submission Receipt as one bottle of vodka

AGENCY CASE #: 87-037611

Two live-scan fingerprint cards bearing the name Hector Rivas (NYSID #01375082H, DOB 02/20/1952, dates fingerprinted 03/24/2015 and 04/17/2015) obtained at the CFS Laboratories via the OCSO RICI System

Four copies of inked fingerprint cards bearing the name Richard F. Conte (NYSID #4107732R, DOB 12/30/1956, dates of arrest 05/10/1980, 06/24/1981, 07/13/1984, and 10/06/1992) received 04/15/2016 from the New York State Division of Criminal Justice Services

One copy of an inked fingerprint card bearing the name Richard Francis Conte (FBI #361734R1) received 04/11/2016 from the Federal Bureau of Investigation's Criminal Justice Information Services Division

One copy of an inked fingerprint card bearing the NYSID #04107732R obtained at the CFS Laboratories via the Statewide Automated Biometric Identification System (SABIS)

One copy of an inked fingerprint card bearing the name Pasquale Barricilla (NYSID #4497062K, DOB 03/22/1961, date of arrest 10/28/1979) received 04/15/2016 from the New York State Division of Criminal Justice Services

One copy of an inked fingerprint card bearing the name Pasquale Barracella (FBI #716323V11) received 04/11/2016 from the Federal Bureau of Investigation's Criminal Justice Information Services Division

One copy of an inked fingerprint card bearing the NYSID #04497062K obtained at the CFS Laboratories via the Statewide Automated Biometric Identification System (SABIS)

RESULTS:

Item 36 (exterior cover of phone book only) was visually examined for the presence of latent prints. No latent prints were observed on Item 36.

Items 35, 40, and 42 (library cards only) were examined for the presence of latent prints utilizing visual, physical, and chemical methods. Twenty-eight latent prints were digitally captured and labeled as follows:

- Item 40 (ashtray) Latent prints 40L114 through 40L124, 40L138 through 40L140
- Item 35 (telephone) Latent prints 35L125 through 35L137
- Item 42 (library card) Latent print 42L141

Examinations of latent prints were conducted using the Analysis, Comparison, Evaluation, and Verification (ACE-V) process with the results indicated in the following tables on pages 3 through 8.

AGENCY CASE #: 87-037611

Latent Print #	Analysis: Suitable for Identification (Yes/No)	Comparison and Evaluation Results: Key: IDENT - compared, subject identified as source of the latent print *- see SABIS statement in report EXC - compared, subject excluded as source of the latent print INC - inconclusive comparison, subject neither identified nor excluded as source of the latent print (area of additional known prints required for conclusive comparison indicated) NC - subject not compared The latent print(s) were compared to the following known prints bearing the name(s):		
		Hector M. Rivas	Pasquale Barracella (alias: Pasquale Barricilla)	Richard Francis Conte
4L1 (broken drink glass)	Yes	See Report of Laboratory Analysis - Report #3	EXC	EXC
4L3 (broken drink glass)	Yes	See Report of Laboratory Analysis - Report #3	EXC	EXC
4L4 (broken drink glass)	Yes	See Report of Laboratory Analysis - Report #3	EXC	EXC
4L5 (broken drink glass)	Yes	See Report of Laboratory Analysis - Report #3	INC (need fully recorded tips and joints of fingers)	INC (need fully recorded tips and joints of fingers)
4L6 (broken drink glass)	Yes	See Report of Laboratory Analysis - Report #3	INC (need fully recorded sides of fingers)	EXC
7L10 (Bacardi bottle)	Yes	See Report of Laboratory Analysis - Report #3	INC (need major case prints)	INC (need major case prints)
7L11 (Bacardi bottle)	Yes	See Report of Laboratory Analysis - Report #3	EXC	EXC
7L12 (Bacardi bottle)	Yes	See Report of Laboratory Analysis - Report #3	EXC	EXC
7L13 (Bacardi bottle)	Yes	See Report of Laboratory Analysis - Report #3	EXC	EXC
9L14 (drink glass)	Yes	See Report of Laboratory Analysis - Report #3	EXC	EXC
9L15 (drink glass)	Yes	See Report of Laboratory Analysis - Report #3	EXC	EXC
9L16 (drink glass)	Yes	See Report of Laboratory Analysis - Report #3	EXC	EXC
9L18 (drink glass)	Yes	See Report of Laboratory Analysis - Report #3	EXC	EXC
9L20 (drink glass)	Yes	See Report of Laboratory Analysis - Report #3	EXC	EXC
9L21 (drink glass)	Yes	See Report of Laboratory Analysis - Report #3	EXC	EXC
11L26 (drink glass)	Yes	See Report of Laboratory Analysis - Report #3	EXC	EXC
11L27 (drink glass)	Yes	See Report of Laboratory Analysis - Report #3	INC (need fully recorded tips and sides of fingers)	EXC
11L28 (drink glass)	Yes	See Report of Laboratory Analysis - Report #3	INC (need fully recorded sides of fingers)	EXC
11L29 (drink glass)	Yes	See Report of Laboratory Analysis - Report #3	EXC	EXC
11L30 (drink glass)	Yes	See Report of Laboratory Analysis - Report #3	EXC	EXC
13L34 (Blue Nun bottle)	Yes	See Report of Laboratory Analysis - Report #3	INC (need fully recorded tips of fingers)	EXC

AGENCY CASE #: 87-037611

Latent Print #	Analysis: Suitable for Identification (Yes/No)	Comparison and Evaluation Results: Key: IDENT - compared, subject identified as source of the latent print *- see SABIS statement in report EXC - compared, subject excluded as source of the latent print INC - inconclusive comparison, subject neither identified nor excluded as source of the latent print (area of additional known prints required for conclusive comparison indicated) NC - subject not compared The latent print(s) were compared to the following known prints bearing the name(s):		
		Hector M. Rivas	Pasquale Barracella (alias: Pasquale Barricilla)	Richard Francis Conte
7L38 (Bacardi bottle)	Yes	See Report of Laboratory Analysis - Report #3	INC (need fully recorded tips and sides of fingers)	EXC
4L43 (broken drink glass)	Yes	See Report of Laboratory Analysis - Report #3	EXC	EXC
9L45 (drink glass)	Yes	See Report of Laboratory Analysis - Report #3	EXC	EXC
9L47 (drink glass)	Yes	See Report of Laboratory Analysis - Report #3	EXC	EXC
9L48 (drink glass)	Yes	See Report of Laboratory Analysis - Report #3	EXC	EXC
4L49 (broken drink glass)	Yes	See Report of Laboratory Analysis - Report #3	EXC	EXC
9L50 (drink glass)	Yes	See Report of Laboratory Analysis - Report #3	EXC	EXC
7L51 (Bacardi bottle)	Yes	See Report of Laboratory Analysis - Report #3	INC (need major case prints)	INC (need major case prints)
5L56 (matchbook)	Yes	See Report of Laboratory Analysis - Report #3	INC (need fully recorded sides of fingers)	INC (need fully recorded sides of fingers)
17L57 (Post-it note)	Yes	See Report of Laboratory Analysis - Report #3	EXC	EXC
10L60 (page from book)	Yes	See Report of Laboratory Analysis - Report #3	EXC	EXC
10L61 (page from book)	Yes	See Report of Laboratory Analysis - Report #3	EXC	EXC
10L63 (page from book)	Yes	See Report of Laboratory Analysis - Report #3	EXC	EXC
10L66 (page from book)	Yes	See Report of Laboratory Analysis - Report #3	INC (need fully recorded sides of fingers)	INC (need fully recorded sides of fingers)
10L68 (plastic book jacket)	Yes	See Report of Laboratory Analysis - Report #3	EXC	EXC
10L69 (plastic book jacket)	Yes	See Report of Laboratory Analysis - Report #3	EXC	EXC
10L70 (plastic book jacket)	Yes	See Report of Laboratory Analysis - Report #3	EXC	EXC
10L71 (plastic book jacket)	Yes	See Report of Laboratory Analysis - Report #3	EXC	EXC
10L72 (plastic book jacket)	No			
10L73 (plastic book jacket)	Yes	INC (need major case prints)	INC (need major case prints)	INC (need major case prints)
10L75 (plastic book jacket)	No			

L15-0654 Report #5 LABORATORY #:

AGENCY CASE #: 87-037611

Latent Print #	Analysis: Suitable for Identification (Yes/No)	Comparison and Evaluation Results: Key: IDENT - compared, subject identified as source of the latent print *- see SABIS statement in report EXC - compared, subject excluded as source of the latent print INC - inconclusive comparison, subject neither identified nor excluded as source of the latent print (area of additional known prints required for conclusive comparison indicated) NC - subject not compared The latent print(s) were compared to the following known prints bearing the name(s):		
		Hector M. Rivas	Pasquale Barracella (alias: Pasquale Barricilla)	Richard Francis Conte
10L76 (plastic book jacket)	Yes	EXC	EXC	EXC
10L78 (plastic book jacket)	Yes	EXC	EXC	EXC
10L79 (plastic book jacket)	Yes	IDENT	NC	NC
10L80 (plastic book jacket)	No			
10L81 (plastic book jacket)	No			
10L82 (plastic book jacket)	Yes	IDENT	NC	NC
10L83 (plastic book jacket)	No			
16L84 (paper with writing)	Yes	EXC	NC (need fully recorded palmprints)	NC (need fully recorded palmprints)
16L85 (paper with writing)	No			
16L86 (paper with writing)	Yes	See Report of Laboratory Analysis - Report #3	EXC	EXC
16L87 (paper with writing)	Yes	INC (need fully recorded sides of fingers)	INC (need fully recorded sides of fingers)	EXC
16L88 (paper with writing)	Yes	EXC	NC (need fully recorded palmprints)	NC (need fully recorded palmprints)
3L89 (Post-it with writing)	No			
3L90 (Post-it with writing)	Yes	EXC	INC (need fully recorded tips and sides of fingers)	EXC
3L91 (Post-it with writing)	Yes	IDENT	NC	NC
3L92 (hand- written letter)	Yes	EXC	EXC	EXC
3L93 (hand- written letter)	Yes	EXC	EXC	EXC
3L94 (hand- written letter)	Yes	EXC	EXC	EXC
3L95 (hand- written letter)	Yes	EXC	EXC	EXC
3L96 (hand- written letter)	Yes	IDENT	NC	NC
3L97 (hand-written letter)	Yes	INC (need fully recorded writer's palms)	NC (need fully recorded palmprints)	NC (need fully recorded palmprints)

AGENCY CASE #: 87-037611

Latent Print #	Analysis: Suitable for Identification (Yes/No)	Comparison and Evaluation Results: Key: IDENT - compared, subject identified as source of the latent print *- see SABIS statement in report EXC - compared, subject excluded as source of the latent print INC - inconclusive comparison, subject neither identified nor excluded as source of the latent print (area of additional known prints required for conclusive comparison indicated) NC - subject not compared The latent print(s) were compared to the following known prints bearing the name(s):		
		Hector M. Rivas	Pasquale Barracella (alias: Pasquale Barricilla)	Richard Francis Conte
3L98 (hand- written letter)	No			
3L99 (hand- written letter)	No			
3L100 (hand-written letter)	No			
3L101 (Post-it with writing)	Yes	IDENT	NC	NC
3L102 (Post-it with writing)	Yes	EXC	EXC	EXC
3L103 (Post-it with writing)	Yes	EXC	EXC	EXC
3L104 (hand-written letter)	No			
3L105 (hand-written letter)	Yes	IDENT	NC	NC
3L106 (hand-written letter)	No			
3L107 (hand-written letter)	Yes	EXC	EXC	EXC
3L108 (hand- written letter)	Yes	IDENT	NC	NC
3L109 (hand- written letter)	No			
3L110 (hand-written letter)	Yes	IDENT	NC	NC
3L111 (hand-written letter)	No			
3L112 (Post-it with writing)	No			
3L113 (hand-written letter)	Yes	EXC	EXC	EXC
40L114 (ashtray)	Yes	IDENT	NC	NC
40L115 (ashtray)	Yes	EXC	EXC	EXC
40L116 (ashtray)	Yes	IDENT	NC	NC
40L117 (ashtray)	Yes	EXC	EXC	EXC
40L118 (ashtray)	Yes	EXC	EXC	EXC

LABORATORY #: L15-0654 Report #5 **AGENCY CASE #:** 87-037611

Latent Print #	Analysis: Suitable for Identification (Yes/No)	Comparison and Evaluation Results: Key: IDENT - compared, subject identified as source of the latent print *- see SABIS statement in report EXC - compared, subject excluded as source of the latent print INC - inconclusive comparison, subject neither identified nor excluded as source of the latent print (area of additional known prints required for conclusive comparison indicated) NC - subject not compared		
		The latent print(s) were compared to the following known prints bearing the name(s):		
		Hector M. Rivas	Pasquale Barracella (alias: Pasquale Barricilla)	Richard Francis Conte
40L119 (ashtray)	Yes	EXC	INC (need fully recorded sides of fingers)	EXC
40L120 (ashtray)	No			
40L121 (ashtray)	No			
40L122 (ashtray)	No			
40L123 (ashtray)	Yes	IDENT	NC	NC
40L124 (ashtray)	Yes	EXC	INC (need fully recorded tips of fingers)	EXC
35L125 (telephone)	Yes	EXC	EXC	EXC
35L126 (telephone)	No			
35L127 (telephone)	Yes	INC (need fully recorded tips of fingers)	INC (need fully recorded tips of fingers)	INC (need fully recorded tips of fingers)
35L128 (telephone)	Yes	EXC	EXC	EXC
35L129 (telephone)	No			
35L130 (telephone)	No			
35L131 (telephone)	Yes	INC (need major case prints)	INC (need major case prints)	INC (need major case prints)
35L132 (telephone)	Yes	INC (need major case prints)	INC (need major case prints)	INC (need major case prints)
35L133 (telephone)	Yes	EXC	INC (need fully recorded palmprints)	INC (need fully recorded palmprints)
35L134 (telephone)	Yes	EXC	EXC	EXC
35L135 (telephone)	Yes	EXC	EXC	EXC
35L136 (telephone)	Yes	EXC	INC (need fully recorded tips of fingers)	EXC
35L137 (telephone)	No			
40L138 (ashtray)	Yes	EXC	EXC	EXC
40L139 (ashtray)	No			

AGENCY CASE #: 87-037611

Latent Print #	Analysis: Suitable for Identification (Yes/No)	Comparison and Evaluation Results: Key: IDENT - compared, subject identified as source of the latent print *- see SABIS statement in report EXC - compared, subject excluded as source of the latent print INC - inconclusive comparison, subject neither identified nor excluded as source of the latent print (area of additional known prints required for conclusive comparison indicated) NC - subject not compared The latent print(s) were compared to the following known prints bearing the name(s):		
		Hector M. Rivas	Pasquale Barracella (alias: Pasquale Barricilla)	Richard Francis Conte
40L140 (ashtray)	Yes	IDENT	NC	NC
42L141 (library card)	No			

A Statewide Automated Biometric Identification System (SABIS) analysis of the remaining unidentified latent prints determined that there are latent prints suitable for SABIS entry. A SABIS search has been deferred at this time per Assistant District Attorney Robert Moran. Examination of Items 37, 38, 39, and 43, as well as examination of the remaining trash contents from Item 42 have also been deferred at this time per Assistant District Attorney Robert Moran. If further examination would significantly aid in the investigation, please contact the author of this report.

If elimination prints of Valerie Hill, or additional known fingerprints or palmprints of Hector M. Rivas, Pasquale Barracella (alias: Pasquale Barricilla), or Richard Francis Conte become available for comparison, please contact the author of this report.

REMARKS:

The digitally captured latent prints from Items 3, 4, 5, 7, 9, 10, 11, 13, 16, 17, 35, 40, and 42 have been preserved and retained at the CFS Laboratories.

Apparent hairs/fibers were observed in Item 42 (trash contents) and retained in the original packaging.

Please see www.criminaljustice.ny.gov/forensic/labreportstandards.htm for definitions of significant terms used in this report.

This report contains the conclusions, opinions and interpretations of the certifying examiner whose signature appears on the report. This report does not constitute the entire case record. The case record may be comprised of worksheets, images, analytical data, and other documents. I certify that this report accurately reflects the results of an examination, comparison, or test performed by me. False statements made herein are punishable as a class A misdemeanor pursuant to Section 210.45 of the Penal Law of the State of New York.

AFFIRMED UNDER PENALTY OF PERJURY

Results Certified By:

Ashley Mull

Latent Print Examiner

'sy Mull

Date: 06/09/2016

Wallie Howard, Jr. Center for Forensic Sciences

CA COUNT

REPORT OF LABORATORY ANALYSIS Report #6

J. RYAN MCMAHON II County Executive

100 ELIZABETH BLACKWELL ST. SYRACUSE, NY 13210 PHONE 315-435-3800 FAX 315-435-5048

INDU GUPTA, MD, MPH Commissioner of Health

FORENSIC BIOLOGY/DNA SECTION

KATHLEEN CORRADO, PhD Director of Laboratories

LABORATORY #: L15-0654 **AGENCY CASE** #: 87-037611 **INVESTIGATING AGENCY:**

Syracuse Police Department 511 South State Street Syracuse, NY 13202

ITEMS FOR EXAMINATION:

ITEM#	RECEIVED	ITEM DESCRIPTION
21.2.1	06/10/2015	Swabbings from pipe 2
25.1	06/10/2015	Swabbings from belt ends
32.1	11/18/2015	Known oral standard from Hector Rivas

RESULTS:

DNA was extracted from the swabbings from pipe 2 (Item 21.2.1) and belt ends (Item 25.1) using the DNA IQ Casework Pro Kit with the Maxwell 16 and quantified using the PowerQuant® System. The DNA from the swabbings from pipe 2 (Item 21.2.1) and belt ends (Item 25.1) and the known oral standard from Hector Rivas (Item 32.1) was amplified by the Polymerase Chain Reaction (PCR) utilizing the Investigator® 24Plex kit for the following loci: the gender marker Amelogenin (AMEL), TH01, D3S1358, vWA, D21S11, TPOX, DYS391, D1S1656, D12S391, SE33, D10S1248, D22S1045, D19S433, D8S1179, D2S1338, D2S441, D18S51, FGA, D16S539, CSF1PO, D13S317, D5S818 and D7S820. Separation and visualization of the Short Tandem Repeat (STR) fragments was achieved using a 3500 Genetic Analyzer. STRmix[™], a probabilistic genotyping software application, was utilized in the analysis of the generated DNA profiles suitable for comparison.

The DNA profiles obtained from the swabbings from pipe 2 (Item 21.2.1) and the belt ends (Item 25.1) are indicative of mixtures of 3 contributors and are suitable for comparison to known standards.

The mixture DNA profile obtained from the swabbing from pipe 2 (Item 21.2.1) is at least 10.9 times more likely if it originated from Hector Rivas and 2 unknown individuals than if it originated from 3 unknown individuals. This likelihood ratio is associated with an inconclusive result based on the laboratory's internal validation; therefore, no conclusion may be made as to whether Hector Rivas is a contributor to the DNA profile obtained.

The major component of the DNA profile obtained from the swabbing from the belt ends (Item 25.1) was contributed by a female donor.

The mixture DNA profile obtained from the swabbing from the belt ends (Item 25.1) is at least 24.3 times more likely if it originated from Hector Rivas and 2 unknown individuals than if it originated from 3 unknown individuals. This likelihood ratio is associated with an inconclusive result based on the laboratory's internal validation; therefore, no conclusion may be made as to whether Hector Rivas is a contributor to the DNA profile obtained.

AGENCY CASE #: 87-037611

None of the DNA profiles generated are eligible for entry into the CODIS database.

If further analysis is desired, please contact the Forensic Biology/DNA section at 435-3800. Please allow a minimum of 12 weeks from the submission of additional evidence for DNA analysis.

REMARKS:

The propositions were formed from the information available at the time of analysis. If this information changes or if other propositions should be considered, please contact the laboratory with sufficient time for additional analysis.

Given the propositions stated, the most conservative likelihood ratio was reported using the lower bound 99% interval accounting for both related and unrelated individuals in the U.S. Caucasian, African American and Hispanic population groups. The population allele frequencies were obtained from the "U.S. population data for 29 autosomal STR loci" and "Corrigendum to 'U.S. Population Data for 29 Autosomal STR Loci" Forensic Science International:Genetics, Volume 31, November 2017, e36-e40.

DISPOSITION OF EVIDENCE: The remaining DNA extracts will be retained at the laboratory. The evidence, including any remaining swabbings from the evidence, will be returned to the submitting agency.

Please see www.criminaljustice.ny.gov/forensic/labreportstandards.htm for definitions of significant terms used in this report. This report contains the conclusions, opinions and interpretations of the certifying examiner whose signature appears on the report. The results of analysis relate only to the items tested and apply to the items as received. This report does not constitute the entire case record. The case record may be comprised of worksheets, images, analytical data, and other documents. I certify that this report accurately reflects the results of an examination, comparison, or test performed by me. False statements made herein are punishable as a class A misdemeanor pursuant to Section 210.45 of the Penal Law of the State of New York.

AFFIRMED UNDER PENALTY OF PERJURY

Results Certified By:

Daniel Cowen, MFS

Forensic Scientist-Forensic Biology/DNA

Date: 12/10/2019